LINGUISTIC VARIATIONS IN THE RECITATIONS OF SELECTED QURANIC CHAPTERS: THE CASE OF ADDITION AND DEDUCTION

VARIAÇÕES LINGÜÍSTICAS NAS RECITAÇÕES DE CAPÍTULOS QURANICOS SELECIONADOS: O CASO DE ADIÇÃO E DEDUÇÃO*

HUSSEIN ALI ABDULLAH AL-THULAYA

Faculty of Islamic Contemporary Studies Universiti Sultan Zainal Abidin, Malaysia husseinali@unisza.edu.com

ISYAKU HASSAN

Faculty of Languages and Communication Universiti Sultan Zainal Abidin, Malaysia isyaku87@gmail.com

Abstract: The Noble Quran was revealed in seven Ahruf (dialects) of recitations, which contains the seven standard modes of readings in the present day. However, there is a paucity of research into the connotations of different modes of Quranic recitations. As such, some grammarians tend to criticize certain recitations, perhaps due to their inadequate knowledge of Quranic exegesis. For this reason, there is an urgent need to conduct a systematic investigation to address the issue of misinterpretation of Quranic verses based on modes of recitations, especially Hafs and other forms of recitations. Therefore, this study aims to address the question of variations between two modes of Quranic recitations, Hafs and Nafi', concerning addition and deduction in two selected chapters, Al-Fatihah (The Opening) and Al-Baqarah (The Cow) and their connotations. The study adopts an inductiveanalytical approach in which Quranic verses from the selected chapters are analyzed to reach valid outcomes. The findings reveal that differences in Hafs and Nafi' modes of recitations do not suggest contradiction but increase our understanding of the meanings of Quranic verses with multiple expressions. The expressions fulfill the basic requirement for the validity of regular modes of recitations. This knowledge helps in exegeses within Quranic verses and reveals the inimitability of the Noble Quran. It is envisaged that this study could advance our understanding of how the variety of recitations can help in forming accurate interpretations of Quranic verses.

Keywords: Exegesis of the Quran. Linguistic variations. Quran modes of recitations.

Resumo: O Nobre Alcorão foi revelado em sete Ahruf (dialetos) de recitações, que contém os sete modos padrão de leitura dos dias atuais. No entanto, há uma escassez de pesquisas sobre as conotações dos diferentes modos de recitações do Alcorão. Como tal, alguns gramáticos tendem a criticar certas recitações, talvez devido a seu conhecimento inadequado da exegese do Alcorão. Por esta razão, há uma necessidade urgente de conduzir uma investigação sistemática para abordar a questão da má

^{*} Artigo recebido em 01/101/2022 e aprovado para publicação pelo Conselho Editorial em 10/10/2022.

© Universidade Católica de Petrópolis, Petrópolis, Rio de Janeiro, Brasil

interpretação dos versos do Alcorão com base nos modos de recitações, especialmente Hafs e outras formas de recitações. Portanto, este estudo visa abordar a questão das variações entre duas modalidades de recitações do Alcorão, Hafs e Nafi', no que diz respeito à adição e dedução em dois capítulos selecionados, Al-Fatihah (A Abertura) e Al-Baqarah (A Vaca) e suas conotações. O estudo adota uma abordagem indutiva-analítica na qual os versos do Alcorão dos capítulos selecionados são analisados para se chegar a resultados válidos. Os resultados revelam que as diferenças nos modos de recitações de Hafs e Nafi não sugerem contradição, mas aumentam nossa compreensão dos significados dos versos do Alcorão com múltiplas expressões. As expressões cumprem o requisito básico para a validade dos modos regulares de recitações. Este conhecimento ajuda em exegeses dentro dos versos do Alcorão e revela a inimitabilidade do Nobre Alcorão. Prevê-se que este estudo possa avançar nossa compreensão de como a variedade de recitações pode ajudar a formar interpretações precisas dos versos do Alcorão.

Palavras-chave: Exegese do Alcorão. Variações linguísticas. Modos de recitações do Alcorão.

1. INTRODUCTION

The Noble Quran was revealed unto Prophet Muhammad (Peace be upon him) in seven Abruf (dialects) of recitations. It was reported by Ubaidullah bin Abdullah (may Allah be pleased with him) that Abdullahi bin Abbas (May Allah be pleased with him) told him that the Prophet (prophet be upon him) said: "Gabriel recited the Qur'an to me in one way. Then I requested him (to read it in another way), and continued asking him to recite it in other ways, and he recited it in several ways till he ultimately recited it in seven different ways" (Al-Bukhari, 1987, Hadith No. 4705). It was narrated from the *Hadith* of Umar bin Al-Khattab (May Allah be pleased with him) that he said: I heard Hisham bin Hakim reciting Surat-al-Furqan during the lifetime of Allah's Messenger (Peace be upon him), I listened to his recitation and noticed that he was reciting in different ways that Allah's Messenger (peace be upon him) had not taught me. I was about to jump over him while he was still in prayer, but I waited patiently and when he finished his prayer, I put my sheet round his neck (and pulled him) and said, "Who has taught you this Surah which I have heard you reciting?" Hisham said, "Allah's Messenger (peace be upon him) taught it to me". I said, "You are telling a lie, for he taught it to me in a way different from the way you have recited it!" Then I started leading (dragging) him to Allah's Messenger (peace be upon him) and said (to the Prophet), "I have heard this man reciting Surah al- Furqan in a way that you have not taught me". The Prophet (peace be upon him) said: "(O 'Umar) release him! Recite, O Hisham". Hisham recited in the way I heard him reciting. Allah's Messenger (peace be upon him) said, "It was revealed like

© Universidade Católica de Petrópolis, Petrópolis, Rio de Janeiro, Brasil

this". Then Allah's Messenger (peace be upon him) said, "Recite, O 'Umar!" I recited in the way he had taught me, whereupon he said, "It was revealed like this", and added, "The Qur'an has been revealed to be recited in seven different ways, so recite of it whichever is easy for you" (Al-Bukhari, 1987, Hadith No 4706).

Additionally, Imam Al-Suyudi (may Allah have mercy on him) mentioned that similar Hadiths were reported by different companions of the Prophet (peace be upon him) (Al-Suyudi, 1974). There might be various reasons for the wisdom behind revealing the Noble Quran on seven dialects, the most important of which could be to ease recitations because Arabs are of different tribes, and each tribe has its dialect with different linguistic variations, which makes it difficult for them to use each other's dialect. As such, Allah (SWT) has blessed the Arabs by revealing the Quran in seven dialects that are sufficient and satisfactory (Ismail, 1999). Nevertheless, scholars have more than 40 differing views regarding the meaning of seven dialects. Some of these views were collected and scrutinized by Imam al-Hafiz bin Al-Jazari (1380) who mentioned that "I have been considering these views and looking at them closely for more than thirty years, until Allah (SWT) showed me what could be right. This is because I examined the recitations, be it regular, irregular, or weak recitation" (Vol. 1, p. 27). According to ibn Al-Jazari, the different views of scholars are still attributable to the seven dialects specifically.

At times, the differences exist only in the letters with no contradiction in meanings and form, for example البخل or بحسب which can be recited in four or two different ways respectively. They often come with slightly different but non-contradictory connotations, such as respectively. They often come with slightly different but non-contradictory connotations, such as or different letters and meaning except form, for example, or differently such as تبلوا-وتتلوا and so on. Also, letters are often changed, for instance, يأتل يتال منكم-منهم and الصراط-السراط ويقتلون or differently such as الصراط-السراط ويقتلون ويقتلون and so on. Also, letters are often changed, for instance, فيقتلون and منكم-منهم additionally, there could be a change of words' positions, such as وأوصى وأوصى and الذكر والأنثى and deduction of letters, for example, الذكر والأنثى and ووصى and cours (Ibn Al-Jazari, 1380, Vol. 1, p. 27). As mentioned by ibn Al-Jazari, variations related to "addition and deduction" represent the most crucial issue among scholars, which indicates the need to conduct a more investigation of how the differences occur and

© Universidade Católica de Petrópolis, Petrópolis, Rio de Janeiro, Brasil

clarify misconceptions in this regard. Therefore, this investigation aims to explore categories of linguistic variations between Hafs and Nafi' in terms of addition and deduction of letters in Al-Fatiha and Al-Bagarah and their connotations.

2. LITERATURE REVIEW

A few studies have recently looked into the modes of recitations, particularly the seven dialects. and their significance in understanding the meaning of Quranic verses. For example, Muhammad and Hamzah (2019) used an inductive-analytical approach to explore the terminology and sources of Quranic recitations. The study revealed that the science of Quranic recitations seeks to clarify the question of variations in terms of meaning and syntax. Similarly, Al-Thulaia (2000) employed a descriptive analytical method to explain the significance of understanding the science of variations in Quranic recitations. According to the study, there is a unanimous agreement among scholars that understanding the different modes of recitations could help in explaining, expounding, and clarifying misconceptions of the meaning of Quranic verses.

More recently conducted by Nabeel (2021) used an inductive method to explore reasons for the criticism of some Quranic recitations. The study enumerated several reasons for such criticism, including a lack of thorough investigation into the original usage of the Arabic language, such as evidence from poetry, prose, speeches, stories, and proverbs, as well as the inadequate knowledge of both regular and irregular modes of recitations. While the above-mentioned studies focused on the benefits of understanding the modes of recitations and reasons for their criticism generally, the current investigation pays particular attention to exploring the question of Quranic recitation difference in terms of addition and deduction of letters.

3. **METHODOLOGY**

This study employed an inductive-analytical method that corroborates evidence from Quranic verses to explore the points of variations in Hafs and Nafi' modes of recitation with

© Universidade Católica de Petrópolis, Petrópolis, Rio de Janeiro, Brasil

particular focus on two Quranic chapters: Al-Fatihah and Al-Baqarah. The inductive-analytical approach aims at generating specific concepts through analysis of raw textual data (Gasson, 2004). According to Thomas (2006), the inductive approach "provides an easily used and systematic set of procedures for analyzing qualitative data that can produce reliable and valid findings" (p. 237). The benefits of using an inductive approach are numerous. This approach, for example, helps to contract raw textual data into a brief and summary form as well as outline a clear link between the research objectives and the findings generated from the raw textual data. It is, therefore, an approach for generating valid findings based on facts. The general inductive approach "provides a simple, straightforward approach for deriving findings in the context of focused evaluation questions" (Thomas, 2006, p. 237).

This study adopted the general analysis procedure described by Thomas (2006). First, verses in the selected chapters of the Noble Quran with evidence of addition and deduction of letters were gathered. Then these verses were studied closely with the aim of identifying variations in terms of addition and deduction of letters. Subsequently, categories were developed from multiple readings of the textual data. The emerging categories were used to form a database that integrates the most important themes concerning addition and deduction of letters in the selected chapters. Finally, the data were interpreted based on the specific research objectives.

4. RESULTS AND DISCUSSION

Variations between Hafs and Nafi' Modes of Recitations in Al-Fatihah and Al-Baqarah

This section the findings regarding the categories of linguistic variations between *Hafs* and *Nafi*' in terms of addition and deduction of letters in *Al-Fatiha* and *Al-Baqarah* and their connotations. According to scholars of recitation science, the addition or deduction of letters in the Noble Quran has nothing to do with interpolation or alteration. The modes of recitations were revealed unto the Prophet (peace be upon him) and they are sufficient and satisfactory. Although some words might differ in form, their connotations remain non-contradictory. The connotations of regular modes of recitations are considered valid in

© Universidade Católica de Petrópolis, Petrópolis, Rio de Janeiro, Brasil

explaining the meaning of Quranic verses. Table 1 shows the categories of differences between the two modes of recitations in the selected chapters.

Table 1. Variations between Hafs and Nafi' concerning addition and deduction

SN	Variation Categories	Verse	Verse No.	Hafs	Nafi'
Surah Al-Fatihah (The Opening)					
1	Addition or deduction of $Alif(^{\dagger})$	مالك يوم الدين	3	مالك	ملك
Surah Al-Baqarah (The Cow)					
	Addition or deduction of $Alif(^{\dagger})$	وما يخدعون إلا أنفسهم وما يشعرون	9	يَخْدَعُونَ	يُخَادِعُونَ
		بلى من كسب سيئة وأحاطت به خطيئته فأولئك أصحاب النار	81	خَطِيئتُهُ	خَطِيئَاتُهُ
		ووصىي بها إبراهيم بنيه ويعقوب يابني إن الله اصطفى لكم الدين	132	وَوَصتَّى	وَ أُوَ صَّى
		ولولا دفع الله الناس بعضهم ببعض لفسدت الأرض	251	دفع	دفاع
		قال انا احيي واميت	258	أنَا	أنا
2	Doubling of letters	ولهم عذاب أليم بما كانوا يكذبون	10	يَكْذِبُونَ	يُكَذِّبُونَ
		وتخرجون فريقا منكم من ديار هم تظاهرون عليهم بالإثم والعدوان	85	تَظَاهَرُونَ	تَظَّاهَرُونَ
		وأن تصدقوا خير لكم إن كنتم تعلمون	280	تَصندَّقُوا	تَصَّدَّقُوا
3	Addition or deduction of <i>Hamzah</i> (*)	ويقتلون النبيين بغير حق	61	النَّبِيِّينَ	الْنَّبِيئينَ
		إن الذين آمنوا والذين هادوا والنصارى والصابئين	62	الصَّابِئِينَ	الصَّابِينَ
		من كان عدوًّا لله وملائكته ورسله وجبريل وميكال	98	ميكال	ميكائل
4	Addition or deduction of $Yaa(\mathfrak{g})$	وإذا سألك عبادي عني فإني قريب أجيب دعوة الداع إذا دعان	186	الدَّاعِ	الدَّاعِ -

As shown in Table 1, there are four categories of variations between Hafs and Nafi' in terms of addition and deduction. The first category relates to the addition or deduction of Alif (أ). For instance, the first word in the third verse of Surah Al-Fatihah is read as ماك according to Hafs and based on Nafi' mode of recitation with a deduction of Alif. In the ninth verse of Surah Al-Bagarah, the word is read as الْبَخْدَعُونَ by Hafs without Alif and by Nafi' as يُخَادِعُونَ with Alif. Although the words' connotations may differ, they are non-contradictory. For example, the word يُخَادِعُونَ (they deceive) with Alif as read by Nafi' is concerned with

Synesis, v. 14, n. 2, p. 259-269, ago/dez 2022, ISSN 1984-6754 © Universidade Católica de Petrópolis, Petrópolis, Rio de Janeiro, Brasil

"reactance". It is also read by Ibn Kathir and Abu Amr with Alif. According to Abu Amr, a person does not decoy but deceive himself. Also, Hafs and the people of Shaam and Kufah read the word as نَخْدُعُونَ without Alif. This is because, according to them, the verse mentions that the hypocrites "think to deceive" Allah (SWT) and those who believe as they said "We believe in Allah and the Last Day", but it is proven that they only deceive themselves (Ibn Zanjalah, n.d., p. 88). Nevertheless, Ibn Khaluyah opines that Nafi' mode of recitation relates to confirmation in this regard, because all of the reciters read the first word in the verse occurrence with a statement unless there is فاعلين (two doers) who share a common action, such as "I fought with [someone else]". Thus, the connotations of the two words are very similar, for instance, المنافذ عنون (they deceive) in this regard (Ibn Khalawaih, 1401, p. 68).

Additionally, Hafs reads the word عَلْمِينَاتُهُ (his sin) without Alif, which represents a singular noun. Whereas, Nafi' recites the word as عَطِينَاتُهُ (his sins) with Alif, denoting a plural noun. In this respect, مُعْلِينَاتُهُ means "polytheism", and it is preceded by سيئة (evil or bad deed) because both word can be used interchangeably. Perhaps, the plural noun عَطِينَاتُهُ is used because even if the two words have singular forms, they might be considered as plural as الحاط (encompass) does not connote singular (Ibn Khalawaih, 1401, p. 83). According to Al-Nairabani (2006), the word's plural form is interpreted in Tafsir (exegeses) as كبائر (great sings), and thus the expression عبائر والمحالة المعارفة والمحالة المحالة المح

The word وَوَصتَّى is recited by Nafi' with Alif and by Hafs as وَوَصتَّى without Alif. According to Al-Maqdisi (2009), this word is of two different dialogues, such as in the form of مُانزلَ accordingly. The former is found in the scriptures of Madinah and Shaam (Syria).

© Universidade Católica de Petrópolis, Petrópolis, Rio de Janeiro, Brasil

In addition, the word دفع is read by Hafs with no Alif and by Nafi' as دفع with Alif. In this regard, Nafi' recitation considers the word origin to be دافع بدافع بدافع بدافع بدافع دفاعا which connotes "defend", while Hafs considers it to be نفع بدفع دفعا (force). Thus, Abu Shamah (n.d.) mentioned that both words are of the same origin دفع يدفع نفع الله as in the form of دافع تت كتابا as in the form of دافع تت كتابا أنا الحيي والميت with Alif. Reciters unanimously agree with the ruling of the word أنا in the case of Waaf (stop) Wasl (continuity) due to differences in dialogues. Nevertheless, the most eloquent dialogue is to deduct Alif in the case of Wasl.

The second category refers to the doubling of a letter. For instance, Nafi' doubles the letter is when reciting the word i كَافَيْنُ by placing Tashdeed (double consonants). By doubling the consonant as in Nafi' mode of recitation, the word connotes "for denying the messengers" or "for denying Prophet Muhammad (SAW). This interpretation could be made because unlike الكذب (die), التكذيب (denying) the messengers can incur severe punishment. Nevertheless, without Tashdeed, the expression could mean they deserve severe punishment as they declare themselves to be believers while hiding their disbelief (Al-Samira'I, 2005). In both modes of recitations, the word refers to hypocrites as they tell lies and deny the Prophet (SAW) for what has been revealed to him. Likewise, in Verse 85, Hafs reads the word ' while Nafi' recites it with Tashdeed, which means "conspiring". Similarly, in Verse 280, Hafs recites the word ' without Tashdeed while Nafi' recites it as ' with Tashdeed, meaning "remit it as a charity" (Ibn Zanjalah, n.d.).

The third category concerns the addition or deduction of Hamzah (٤). For instance, in Verse 61, the word المستعفل is recited by Hafs without Hamzah and by as Nafi' as النبيث with Hamzah. According to Ibn Zanjalah (n.d.), Nafi' mode of recitation considers the word to be from أخبر (inform) as mentioned in Surah Al-Tahreem Verse 3 أخبر (who informed you of this?). Thus, the Prophet (peace be upon him) informs (bring messages from Allah). Whereas, Hafs considers the word's connotation to be المناف (high) because, according to Ibn Zanjalah, a Prophet is called نبي due to his high position. Nevertheless, similar words found in the Noble Quran are based on the rule followed by Nafi' except a few words such as the singular and plural of أولياء and وليء In a different case, Hafs recites the word

© Universidade Católica de Petrópolis, Petrópolis, Rio de Janeiro, Brasil

with Hamzah while Nafi' recites it as الصَّالِين without Hamzah. According to Ibn Khalawaih (1401), Hafs considers the word to be derived from صبأ (defect from) in the case of a person converting from one religion to another. However, Nafi' considers the word to be derived from صباي because his mind can be inclined to fun (Al-Abyari, 1405).

Additionally, the name ميكال in Verse 98 is recited by Hafs with no Hamzah and by Wafi' as ميكائل with Hamzah. This difference is viewed by the majority of scholars as a dialectic variation. According to Ibn Al-Jauzi (1422), five Arabic dialects pronounce the word without Hamzah is the dialect of the people of Hajaz, and it is recited as such by Abu Amr and Hafs from A'sim. Second, ميكائيل with Yaa (ي) preceded by Hamzah is the dialect of Tameem and Qais as well as many from the people of Najd. Also, Ibn A'mir, Ibn Kathir, Hamzah, Al-Kisa'I, and Abu Bakr from A'sim recite the word in this form. Third, with Hamzah preceded by Alif without Yaa as recited by Nafi', Ibn Shambouth, Ibn Al-Sabahi all from Qumbul. Fourth, ميكئل as recited by Muhaisin. Firth, ميكائين with Hamzah alongside Yaa and Nuun (i) preceded by Alif as mentioned by Al-Ambari (Ibn Al-Jauzi, 1422). These variations could be because مبكال is a non-Arabic name, Allah knows best. Finally, the fourth category is concerned with the addition or deduction of Yaa. For instance, in Verse 186, Hafs recites the word الدَّاع without Yaa while Nafi' recites it with Yaa. Also, Warsh and Abu Amr recited the word with Yaa in the case of continuation, whereas other reciters removed it. The reciters follow the word's origin in the case of continuation, and in the case of stopping, they follow the rule of the scripture. However, some reciters read the word without Yaa even in the case of continuation as they try to avoid breaking the rule of the scripture (Ibn Zanjalah, n. d.).

5. CONCLUSION

This study investigated linguistic variations in Hafs and Nafi' modes of recitations in terms of addition and deduction of letters as well as their connotations. The findings revealed four categories of variations between the two modes of recitations, consisting of addition or

© Universidade Católica de Petrópolis, Petrópolis, Rio de Janeiro, Brasil

deduction of *Alif*, *Hamzah*, *Yaa* and doubling of letters. According to the findings, differences between the two modes of recitations do not suggest contradiction but help us to understand the meanings of Quranic verses with multiple expressions. Also, the expressions fulfill the basic requirement for the validity of regular modes of recitations. This knowledge helps in exegeses within Quranic verses and reveals the inimitability of the Noble Quran. It is envisaged that this study could advance our understanding of how the variety of recitations can help in forming accurate interpretations of Quranic verses. Nevertheless, the study is limited to variations in the case of addition and deduction of letters in two selected chapters, i.e Al-Fatihah and Al-Baqarah. Further research may investigate these variations in chapters other than those investigated in the present study.

REFERENCES

The Noble Quran

Al-Abyari, I. I. (1405). *Al-Mausu'ah al-Qur'aniyyah* (Quranic Encyclopedia). Beirut: Mu'assah al-Sijil al-Arab.

Al-Ahwazi, A. A. I. Y. (2002). Al-Wajeez fi Sharhi al-Qira'at al-Thamaniyah li Amsar al-Khamsah (A handbook for the explanation of the eight recitations by five Amsar reciters). Beirut: Daar al-Gharb al-Islami.

Al-Bukhari, M. I. I. A. (1987). Al-Jami' Al-Musnad Al-Sahih Al-Mukhtasar min Umur Rasul al-Allah Sallahu Alaihi Wa Sallam wa Sunanihi wa Ayyamihi (A collection of authentic and solid summary from the affairs, tradition and days of the Prophet peace be upon him). Beirut: Dar Ibn Kathir

Al-Maqdisi, A. M. M. A. (2009). Fath al-Rahman fi Tafseer al-Quran (The opening of al-Rahman in the exegeses of the Quran). Beirut: Dar Al-Nawader.

Al-Nayrabani, A. (2006). Al-Jawanib al-Sawtiyyah fi Kutub al-Ihtijaj lil Qira'at. (Pronunciation aspect in the books of proof for recitations). Dimashq: Dar al-Ghawthani li al-Dirasaat al-Quraniyyah.

Al-Samira'I, I. S. S (2005). *Ikhtilaf fi al-Qira'at al-Qur'aniyyah wa Athrihi fi al-Ittisa' al-Ma'ani: Dirasat wa Abhath fi al-Quran wa U'lumihi* (Difference in Quranic recitations and its influence on the connotations. Studies and research in Quran and its sciences). *Journal of Tikrit University for the Humanities*, 12(5), 59-90.

Al-Suyudi, A. A. J. (1974). *Al-Itqan fi Ulum al-Quran* (proficiency in Quranic sciences). Al-Qahirah: Al-Hai'ah al-Misriyyah Al-Ammah Lil-Kitab.

Al-Thulaia, H. A. A. (2000). Qurra al-Sahabah al-Ladhina Talaqqau an al-Nabiy Sallallahu Alaihi Wa Sallam Wa Wasalana Isnaduhum (Reciters among the companions who reported from the Prophet peace be upon him and their chains of transmission has reached us). Hikmah: International Journal of Islamic Studies and Human Sciences, 3(4), 271-297.

Gasson, S. (2004). Rigor in grounded theory research: An interpretive perspective on generating theory from qualitative field studies. In *The handbook of information systems research* (pp. 79-102). IGI Global.

© Universidade Católica de Petrópolis, Petrópolis, Rio de Janeiro, Brasil

Ibn Al-Jauzi, J. A. M. (1422). Zaad al-Masir fi I'lm al-Tafsir (A great direction in the science of exegesis). Beirut: Daar al-Kutub al-Arabi.

Ibn Al-Jazari, S. M. M. Y. (1380). *Ghayah al-Nihayah fi Tabaqat al-Qurra* (The ultimate end in the categories of reciters). Beirut: Dar Al-Kutub Al-Ilmiyah

Ibn Khalawaih, A. M. A. (1401). *Al-Hujjah fi al-Qira'at al-Sah'a* (A proof in the seven modes of recitations). Beirut: Dar Al-Shuruq.

Ibn Zanjalah, A. M. A (n.d.). *Hujjah al-Qira'at* (A proof for the modes of recitations). El-Madina El-Monawara, Al Munirah: Dar El Resala El Islameya.

Ismail, M. B. (1999). *Dirasat fi Ulum al-Quran* (Studies in the sciences of the Qur'an). Amman: Dar Al-Manar.

Muhammad, A. H., & Hamzah, A. (2019). Taujeeh al-Qira'at, Ta'rifuhu. Asma'uhu, Musdalahatunu, Masadiruhu: Dirasah Istiqra'iyah Tahliliyyah (meaning of Quranic recitations, definitions, names, terminologies, and sources: An inductive analytical study). *Journal of the Faculty of Fundamentals of Religion and Da'wah, Al-Azhar University, 31*(3), 2199-2234

Nabeel, M. (2021). Qira'ah Jadidah li Asbab al-Da'an fi Qira'at al-Qura'niyya (A new reading of the reasons for the criticism of Quranic recitations). *Almi'yaar Journal*, 25(62), 13-30.

Thomas, D. R. (2006). A general inductive approach for analyzing qualitative evaluation data. *American Journal of Evaluation*, 27(2), 237-246.